The Miracle of Ibn Zar'ah in Coptic Tradition Texts and Icons

Youhanna Nessim Youssef

There is a Coptic tradition that refers to the transfer of Mount al-Muqattam during the Caliphate of al-'Aziz (975 - 996), or perhaps that of al-Mu'iz li-din allah the Fatimid (972 - 975), after a calumny by a Jewish advisor.¹ In this article, I will discuss the different sources for this legend, its iconographic dipiciton in an icon at the Church of Mu'allaqah,² and the tradition linking a pillar at that church to the appearance of the Virgin Mary to the Coptic patriarch Abraham ibn Zar'ah.

Egyptian Sources

The earliest reference to this insident is in the Fiftheenth Canon of Patriarch Christodolus (1047 - 1077 AD), which mentions the addition of three days to the Fast of the Nativity. Although it does not provide a reason, later tradition justified the additon as a commemoration of the Miracle of the Transfer of the Muqattam:³

Likewise the Fast of the Holy Nativity shall be from the Feast of Saint Menas (Mīna), i.e. the fifteenth day of Hatūr, to the twenty-ninth day of Kyahk.⁴

An explanation is not given by Ibn al-Assal in his Nomocanon,⁵ or Ibn Kabar (+1334 AD) in his *Lamp of Darkness*.⁶

According to the *History of the Patriarchs*, written by Michael Bishop of Tinnīs and compiled by Mawhub ibn Mansūr in the eleventh century:⁷

¹ For this site and another approach cf. Yusuf Ragib, 1999, pp. 159-184.

 2 The miracle itself does not enter in our scope; we are studying the evolution of a text and its impact on an icon.

³ Heg. Yuhanna Salama, Vol II, 4th edition, Cairo 1979, p. 386.

⁴ Burmester, 1932, pp. 74-75 (text), p. 79 (translation).

⁵ Graf, 1947 pp. 388-403; Samir Khalil, 1985, pp. 1-30; idem, 1985a, pp. 285-296; idem, 1991, pp. 2075 - 2079. For his nomocanon, see Girgis Fîluthâûs ^cAwad, 1908, p. 172.

⁶ L. Villecourt, 1925, p. 265.

⁷ J. Den Heijer, 1989, pp. 9-10, 96-116.

Coptica 8 (2009), 81 - 96.

It happened after some days that he (the Bû Jacob ibn Killis the Jew) found a way (to have) an audience to say to al-Mu'izz: "It is written in the Gospel of the Christians 'If one hath faith as a grain of mustered-seed and he saith to the mountain: Be thou removed and be thou cast into the sea, it shall be done. (Matt. 17:20) Let the Commander of the Faithful see his way to ask them to prove the truth of this saying, so that he may know they are frauds and are liars. If they do not do (this), it is requisite that there should be done to them what they deserve on account of their lie." He (al-Mu'izz) approved of this word. The king al-Mu'izz sent to summon Anba Abraham and said to him "What sayest thou concerning this word?" Is it in your Gospel or not?" The Patriarch said: "Yea, it is in it"

The patriarch ordered the monks in the patriarchal cell to assemble in the Church of the Virgin Mary to fast and pray:

This blessed gathering took place in Church of the Mistress in Kasr al-Sham' known as the Mu'allaqah. When it was the morning of the third day, the saintly patriarch to the ground from grief of heart and from his fasting and wearing, and he slept for a while. He saw the Lady, the pure Mistress, Mary and she said to him.⁸

It is clear that the *History of the Patriarchs* indicated that the vision was in a dream, though it does not mention the pillar. It should be noticed also that the first narration of this miracle is nearly one hundred year after the event.

The Book of the *Churches and Monasteries*⁹ attributed to Abū Sālih in the late twelfth century, mentions the story of the transfer of Mount al-Muqattam in the context of the disscussion about the church of Saint Mercurius. The author of that book refers to a copy of the *History of the Patriarchs*:¹⁰

⁸ A.S. Atiya, Y. Abd-al-Masih, O.H.E. Burmester, 1948, pp. 94 -96 (text), pp. 140 - 144 (translation).

⁹ Samuel al-Suriani, 1984, 4 vol., and also Evetts and Butler, 1895. For specific studies cf. Samuel al-Suriani, 1990, p. 78. (For codicology and Composition) Zanetti, 1995, pp. 85-133. (For the Authorship and Influence) Den Heijer, 1993, pp. 209-219. (Social study of the Delta) Martin, 1997, pp. 181-199; Youhanna Nessim Youssef, 1995, pp. 101-103; idem, 1998-1999, pp. 45-54.

¹⁰ Martin, 1997, pp. 181-199 especially p. 184.

Then in the time of this patriarch (anba Ephraim the Syrian), inquiries were made about the creed of the Christians, whether they believed in the truth or in a lie. So the Christians assembled and went out to the mountain and the Muslims and Jews went out at the same time, on account of a certain event which is related in the History of the Church...Then the patriarch came forward them, and the *Tanner*, from whom God had performed a miracle followed him... This miracle took place through the faith of the *Tanner*, who had plucked out his own eye by the root, and in the presence of al-Aziz (975 - 996).¹¹

Nearly all the manuscripts of the synaxarium of the Coptic Church mention the commemoration of this patriarch on Kyahk 6^{th} :¹²

When it was the dawn of the third day, the Lady, the pure Mistress, Mary the Mother of God appeared to him and informed him about a holy Tanner.¹³

None of these sources associate the vision with a pillar. Likewise the commemoration in the *Difnar* (Antiphonarium) on the 6th of Kyahk:¹⁴

амоү шарон мфооү ш пігумнотос піоуро наікєос дауіа піпрофнтнс

- 21NA NTEKCAXI БЕН ОУПАРРНСІА ЕПІМАКАРІСМОС NTE ПІРШМІ НӨМНІ
- пенкит мпатріархне авва авраам пімакаріос єтірі занффирі
- $\begin{array}{c} \text{пехад is woyniatg mpipumi nomhi etersof batch} \\ \text{MPGC nequoy} \end{array}$

Ν2ΡΗ ΡΕΝ ΝΕΦΕΝΤΟΛΗ ΕΦΕΦΟΥΟΙ¹⁵ ΕΒΟΛ ΕΦΕΧΕΜΧΟΜ ΡΕΝ ΠΚΑ2Ι ΝΧΕ ΠΕΦΧΡΟΧ

ΠΙΡωμι Ναικέος αββά αβράαμ νε ούζερος πε μεν πζα Ννιμανώαι

¹¹ B.T. Evetts and A. Butler, 1895, fol. 34b.

 12 Except Ms N° 4869 from *Bibliothèque Nationale de Paris* edited by Basset; cf. Meinardus 1977, p. 89.

¹³ Forget, 1963, pp.137-138. For a study of the different versions of this liturgical book, see Coquin 1977, pp. 351-365.

 14 For a study of this liturgical book cf Gawdat Gabra, 1996, pp. 37-52. 1998, pp. 48-64.

 15 Read eqeoywayc.

- аді бурні бхимі ноумищ псоп убн оупрагматіа же надоі нещшт
- етаунау ероц же оурсимі нөмні ауірі ммоц ноуархнереус
- а ф \uparrow пімаіршмі ірі єхєн нецхіх 16 нганніці мем ганщфнрі єчощ
- αφωχί ναε πίωνι ζίτεν νεφεγχή αφοίς ναε πίτωογ ογος αφι επέςητ
- aques zanmhu ndici zixen¹⁷ nitapanomoc a $\pi \overline{xc}$ nozem mmog den negzoxzex thpog
- aqmton mmoq den taiezooy dai aqujenaq za ta $\overline{x}\overline{c}$ dh etamenpitq

γιτέν νιέγχη

Come to us, today, o *psalmist*, the *righteous* King David the *prophet*

In order to speak openly about the blessing of the righteous man

Our father the patriarch Abba Abraam the *blessed*, who performed miracles

He (David) said: "Blessed is the man who fears the Lord, his God and he shall find joy in His commandments. His descent shall be the mightiest in the land."¹⁸

- The *righteous* man is Abba Abraam who was a *Syrian* from the East.
- He came down to Egypt many times for *commerce* since he was a merchant.
- When they [people and clergy] saw that he was a righteous man, they made him *patriarch*.
- God the lover of mankind made great miracles and many wonders through him¹⁹
- The stone broke down though his prayers, the mount was lifted and came down. $^{20}\,$
- He received many pains through the *impious*; *Christ* saved him from all his suffering

 16 Arabism a literal translation of the Arabic translation عمل على يديه

- ¹⁹ Lit. "on his hands."
- ²⁰ De Lacy O' Leary, 1926, pp. 78-79.

¹⁷ Read 2ITEN.

¹⁸ Ps 112[111]:1

He rested in this day and he went to *Christ* whom he loved Through his *prayers*

- абісі гар ємации и пениит мпатріархне нурні бен тфе нем іжен піказі авва авраам пісерос
- ογνικμή ον πε πεκταίο νεм πεκβίος ναγγελικόν νεμ πεκ[θεβίο] παρθενία ετχηκ εβόλ
- πλιρητ λαχωκ εβολ εχωκ Νχε πιζαχι μπενοωτηρ βεν πεαεγληγελιον έθη μπλιρητ εαχω μμος
- же ноштен ња нн етауогі немні нурні <u>ьен</u> напірасмос †насемні немштен нте †діа
өнкн ебу
- ερετενογών ερετενών νεμμί ζίχεν τατραπεζα νζρμι βεν ταμετογρό βεν πιεζοογ νβαε
- ερετενγεμαί γίχεν γληθρονός μεν ογώου νατοάχι μου ερετεντγγία τη το τίδι μαράλη και το τίσλ
- апаісаді мплатікон дшк євол єгрні єдшк ш пініц \uparrow нархієреус пенішт $\overline{с \Theta Y}$ авва авраам
- κε γαρ ακιρί ΝγαΝωφήρι Νεμ γαΝΧΟΜ μεν Νιλαος αιώανταογε ογκογχί Νμητογ ώαρε πιςαχί ογωώς εμαφώ
- εταφογωψ μχε πχς εήμτον μακ μεν μεκμις! αφογοθεκ υνεφοκγνη μεπογρανιον ψα ενες
- oyo2 akmton mmok ben coy5 milabot xoiak akepwai nem nh \overline{eeg} ben txwpa nte nh etwnd
- μέν πλιέζοογ έθγ λαφί μπιχλομ νλτλώμ ντε τεμπλαρτγρός νχε πιπρέςβγτερος λπατόλος
- 2ιτεν νογεγχή έθη πχς φή πενсωτήρ αριογναι νέμαν ναγαπή μέν πεκμαή2απ έτοι ν20ή
- You became elevated, O our father *patriarch*, in heaven and on earth, Abba Abraam the *Syrian*
- Great also is your honor and your *evangelical life* and your perfect humility and virginity
- The word of our *Saviour* in His holy *Gospel* has been accomplished upon you, saying thus:
- "You are he who stood (firmly) by me in my times of *trial*; I will establish with you a holy *covenant*
- You shall eat and drink at my *table* in my kingdom in the last day

- You will sit on *thrones* with unspeakable glory and you will judge the twelve *tribes* of Israel."²¹
- This *spiritual* word was accomplished on you, O great *patriarch*, our holy father abba Abraam
- *For* you performed miracles and powers for the peoples, if I utter a little of them, my discourse shall be extremely long.
- When *Christ* wished to give rest to him from your pains, he transferred you to His heavenly eternal dwelling.
- And you rested on the sixth day of the month of Kihak, you make the feast with the saints in the *lands* of living.
- On that holy day, the *priest* Apatolos took the imperishable crown of the *martyrdom*
- Through their holy *prayers*, *Christ* God our *Saviour* have mercy and *charity* upon us in your fearful *tribune*.

Both texts make an allusion to the miracle of the transfer of the mountain, without giving details about the prayer, the icon of the Virgin, or any allusion to pillar. It shows perhaps an earlier stage of the life of the patriarch Abbam the Syrian.

The *History of the Patriarchs* attributed to Anba Yusab Bishop of Fuwwah (consecrated in 1235 AD) did not mention the name of the Tanner. Additionally, the fast of three days was only for the monks of St. Macarius in the patriarchal cell.

When it was the dawn of the third day, the patriarch fall asleep from fasting and grief. Soon thereafter the Lady, the Mistress, appeared to him and said to him, "Why are you so sad?"²²

Butrus Ibn al-Rahib (XIII century) briefly mentioned the story,²³ stating for the first time that the apparition of the Virgin was next to a pillar.²⁴ The Ethiopian Synaxarium of the 6th month (Tahscasch) identifies the Tanner as Simon the Shoemaker,²⁵ and states that the revealtion was by the Virgin Mary. The Synaxarium dedicated a Sallam (Praise) for Simon the Shoemaker.²⁶ This story is mentioned in a Syriac manuscrit written in Garshuni witn many details.²⁷ An

- ²³ A.Y. Sidarus 1982, pp. 396-397.
- ²⁴ L. Cheikho 1962, p. 134.
- ²⁵ For this book, see Colin 1988, pp. 273-317.
- ²⁶ Grébaut 1926, pp. 618-628 [76-86]
- ²⁷ Leroy, 1909, pp. 380-340; 1910, pp. 26-41.

²¹ Lk. 28 :30.

²² Samuel al-Suriani and Nabih Kamel Daoud, 1992, pp. 91-92, fol. 88 v-89r.

earlier version of that text may be sought in Ms Arabe 282, which perserves an intermediate phase between the text of the *History of the Patriarchs* and that perserved in the Syriac manuscript.²⁸ Three Manuscripts from the XVII - XVIII centuries kept in the Library of the Coptic Patriarchate narrate this story with details.²⁹

As we can expect, Maqrizi (XV century) did not mention this story, though he mentioned the patriarch.³⁰ Ibn Saïd al-Antaqi did not mention the story, but he mentioned that the news concerning the death of al-Mu[°]izz had been hidden for eight months and that during his life his son al-[°]Aziz had been elected Caliph.

Western Sources³¹

Symon Semeonis an Irishman who visited Egypt between 1322 and 1324 AD mentioned the marble pillar from where the Virgin had talked to a Jacobite for the liberation of the Christian. Nicolas de Poggibonsi (1346 - 1350 AD) purportedly saw a sculpture of the Virgin on the pillar. In 1384 AD, Frescobaldi mentioned that a sculpture of the Virgin on a pillar spoke in the presence of the sultan. Poloner, in 1422, made an allusion to a pillar from which a voice came out. Lannoy (1421 - 1423 AD) called the Church of Mu'allaqah the Church of the Pillar. Van Ghistele, in 1485, is more precise, stating that a voice came out of the marble pillar on the left, and hence the church was named the Church of the Pillar.

Neither Thenaud 1512 nor Affagart mentioned the pillar. Vansleb, writting in 1672 - 1673 AD, states:³²

At the entry of this Church (Maallaca) a little Image is to be seen, at the right hand, upon one of the pillars which Image, the Copties say, spoke to Ephrem, one of their Patriarchs, to comfort him in his affliction when Meez me din alla, The Califf, commanded him to transport Mount Gebel il mocattam, which nom stands behind the Castle of Cairo, to prove the truth of his Religion, because our Saviour Christ faith in the Gospel, If you had faith as a grain of Mustardseed, you should say to this

²⁸ Den Heijer, 1994, pp.192-202, especially pp. 198-199.

²⁹ Simaika, 1942, N°625/6 (dated 1664 A.D.), 640/10 (undated), 659/11 (dated 1787 A.D.). See also Troupeau 1974, N° 4777/4 p. 28, N°4788/6 Manuscript from the XIX Century; cf. Graf, 1947, p. 306.

³⁰ Macrizi, 1979, p. 25 (text).

³¹ Coquin, 1974, pp. 74-75, 79.

³² For Vansleb, cf. Delahaye, 2003, pp. 113-122.

*Mountain, remove; and it shall remove; and nothing shall be impossible unto you.*³³

Fourmont (1746 - 1750 AD) copied Vansleb's description word by word.

The Icon of Ibn Zar'ah and Simon the Tanner

The icon is preserved in the Church of Mu'allaqah.³⁴ It depicts the patriarch at the center with a white beard, wearing the patriarchal vestment, and holding a staff in his right hand. His left hand is holding Simon the Tanner who is wearing a short tunic and carrying on his shoulder two pots of water.

The Virgin Mary is presented in a mandorla pointing to the patriarch. The mandorla is above a pillar. According to Raouf Habib, there is an Arabic inscription that dates this icon to the fifteenth century.³⁵ It is important to mention that Simon the Tanner is depicted with two opened eyes not one eyed as in the abovementioned texts.

The Icon of Ibn Zar'ah and the Book of Glorifications

The book³⁶ of Glorifications contains a hymn for the Virgin Mary, we will give the text in full:

φαι πε φλγμην ντθεοτοκος μαρία θμαγ Νίπς πχς

оустуллос етероушии маріа †өеотокос

еөве фаі а пен \overline{cwp} оли еђоун етеиметоуро

αφήνας ννιαγαθού νη έτε μπέβαλ ναγ έρωογ

оушиат ибо маріа твш налолі итафині

ноо гар пе пургос етбосі ката псахі мпісофос

ибо гар оусшт налам ием неушны тироу бусоп

маріа фраціі иніаггєлос маріа піхлом инімартурос піагіос $\overrightarrow{\text{NIM}}$

This is the *icon*³⁷ of the *God-Bearer* Mary the mother of Jesus *Christ*

³³ Vansleb, 1678, pp. 141-142.

³⁴ Nabil Selim Atalla, 1993, p. 40a.

³⁵ Raouf Habib, 1966, p.14.

³⁶ For this book, see Youhanna Nessim Youssef 1993, pp. 139-147; 1995, pp. 77-83.

You are the luminous *pillar*, Mary the *God Bearer*

Therefore our Saviour lifted him to His kingdom

He granted him the *good things*, which an eye has not seen³⁸ Blessed are you Mary the true vine

For you are the high *tower*, according to the word of the wise man^{39}

For you are the salvation of Adam and his all children together Mary is the joy of the *angels*, the crown f the *martyrs, the saint* So So⁴⁰

The text refers to an icon of the Virgin Mary in the first and second stanzas. This text gives the Virgin the title of "luminous pillar," which is a title of Christ according to the Lobsh of the Theotokia of Friday:

ΝΘΟ ΠΕΤΑΡΕΦΑΙ 5Α ΠΙΟΤΥΛΛΟΟ ΕΤΑΦΝΑΥ ΕΡΟΟ ΝΧΕ Μωγομο ετε φαι πε πωμρι μφ† εταφι αφωωπι 5εΝ τενεχι

You are the one who carried the *Pillar*, which Moses saw, who is the Son of God who came and dwelt in your womb.⁴¹

The stanza refers to Ex. 13:21-2, 14:19. The third and fourth stanzas are taken from the doxology of Saint Menas and the other martyrs. It is important to mention that the text here is addressed in masculine not feminine. Mary as the "true vine" is a title of the Virgin in the *Horologion* for the *troparia* of the Third Hour.⁴² As for the last stanza, "Mary the crown of the martyrs, saint," it is clear the text here is a patchwork. If we consider this text with the icon of Mu'allaqah, however, it becomes comprehensible.

The first two stanzas are pointing to the icon and the Virgin as a pillar, which corresponds exactly to our icon. The third and fourth stanzas are addressed to the Patriarch Abraham ibn Zar'ah who was considered as martyr. The icon shows the Virgin Mary on the pillar as a high tower. The last stanza, "You are the salvation of Adam and all

 $^{^{37}}$ For this word, see Godron, 1983, pp. 1-52; Godron 1990, pp. 43-47; Youhanna Nessim Youssef, 1997, pp. 101-105. For other words for icons, see Coquin, 1993, pp. 171-174.

³⁸ 2 Cor 12:4.

³⁹ Proverbs 18:10.

⁴⁰ Attalla Arsenios al-Moharraqqi, 1972, pp. 13-14.

⁴¹ For the Theotokia, see Youhanna Nessim Youssef, 1997, pp. 153-170; idem, 2003, pp. 93-108; idem, 2004, pp. 127-140.

⁴² Burmester, 1973, p. 43 (Coptic text), p. 164 (Translation), p. 22 (Arabic).

his children," refers indirectly to the Christian of Egypt threaten by the governor and saved by the vision of the Patriarch who saw the Virgin.

Conclusion

From what we exposed, we can follow the development of the story of Simon the Tanner. The first mentioned of the account is in the *History of the Patriarchs* written in Coptic by Michael bishop of Tinnīs in the middle of the eleventh century, which was translated into Arabic by Mawhub ibn Mansur later that same century. This places the earliest account nearly a century after the event. There, nothing is mentioned about the Tanner and the vision of the Virgin is considered a dream. By the end of the twelfth and the beginning of the thirteenth centuries, the compilers of the Book of the *Churches and Monasteries* (Abu al-Makarim/Abu Salih) mentioned this story and added the name of the Tanner (anonymous till now). The Coptic Arabic Synaxarium (thirteenth century) narrated the same story with the same details as Abu al-Makarim.

The Antiphonarion's account is very brief and does not give much detail. While the Ethiopian Synaxarium revised the Arabic text and added the name of the Tanner and enriched the text with more details, it did not mention the vision of the Virgin at the pillar. Starting in the fourteenth century and continuing through the eighteenth century, most western travellers mentioned the story of the transfer of the mountain according to an oral tradition and added that the Virgin appeared at the pillar.

The history attributed to Ibn al-Rahib in the fourteenth century clearly refers to the pillar. The icon at al-Mu^callaqah depicts the same tradition. The doxology in the *Book of Glorification* should hence be dated no earlier than the fourteenth century; the author mentioned the pillar and the salvation of the Children of Adam (meaning the Copts).



Icon of Patriarch Abraham ibn Zar'ah and Simon at al-Mu'allaqah (N.S. Atalla, 1993, 40a)

Bibliography

Y. Abd al-Masih, see A.S. Atiya, O.H.E. Burmester.

N.S. Atalla, 1993

The Escape to Egypt according to Coptic Tradition, Lehnert & Landrock, Cairo.

A.S. Atiya, Y. Abd-al-Masih, O.H.E. Burmester, 1948 *History of the Patriarchs of the Egyptian Church known as the History of the Holy Church*, Vol.II part II, [*Textes et Documents*4] Le Caire: Publication de la Société d'Archéologie Copte.

Attalla Arsenios al-Moharraggi, 1972

ПХШМ NTE NIXINTÉOY $\overline{e}\overline{e}\overline{y}$ NTAPOENOC NIATTELOC NIATOCTOLOC NIAT NEM NH $\overline{e}\overline{e}\overline{y}$ [The book of the holy glorifications of the Virgin, the Angels, the Apostles and the Saints], Cairo.

G.F. ^cAwad, 1908

al-Majmu^c al-Safawî alladhi jamma^chu al-^callama al-Qibtî al-Shaykh al-Safyî abî al-Faday'il ibn al-^cassal (The Collection of al Safi - The Book of Canons assembled by the Coptic Scholar al-Sheikh abû al-Fadaïl Ibn al-Assal) Cairo.

O.H.E. Burmester, 1932

"The Canons of Christodolus, Patriarch of Alexandria (AD 1047-1077)." *Le Muséon* 45: 74-80.

____, 1973

The Horologion of the Egyptian Church, Studia Orientalia Christiana Aegyptiaca, Cairo.

O.H.E. Burmester see A. S. Atiya, Yassa Abd-al-Masih.

L. Cheikho, 1962

Petrus Ibn Rahib, Chronicon Orientale, Corpus Scriptorum Christianorum Orientalium 45, Louvain: Peeters.

G. Colin, 1988

"Le Synaxaire Ethiopien: Etat actuel de la question." *Analecta Bollandiana* 106: 273-317.

Ch. Coquin, 1974

Les edifices Chrétiens du Vieux-Caire, Bibliothèque d'Etudes Coptes XI, Le Caire : Institut Français d'Archéologie Orientale.

R.G. Coquin, 1977

"Le synaxaire des Coptes, un nouveau témoin de la récension de la Haute Egypte." *Analecta Bollandiana* 96: 351-365.

____, 1993

"Encore une fois 2ICON = 100V." Orientalia 62: 171-174.

"Johann Michael Vansleb (1635-1679) voyageur en Egypte et en Orient pour le compte de la Bibliothèque royale." *Le Monde Copte* 33: 113-122.

J. Den Heijer, 1989

Mawhûb ibn Mansûr ibn Muffarig et l'historiographie coptoarabe, Corpus Scriptorum Christianorum Orientalium 513-Subsidia 83, Louvain: Peeters.

___, 1993

"The Composition of the History of the Churches and Monasteries of Egypt -Some preliminary remarks." In *Acts of the Fifth International Congress of Coptic Studies Washington 12-15 August 1992*, ed. D. Johnson, Vol 2 Part 1, Roma, CMCL), pp. 209-219.

___, 1994

"Apologetic elements in Coptic-Arabic Historiography: The life of Afraham Ibn Zar'ah, 62nd Patriarch of Alexandria." In *Christian Arabic Apologetics during the Abbasid Period* ed Samir Khalil and Jorgen S. Nielsen, *Studies in the History of the Religions* LXIII, Leiden: Brill, pp. 192 - 202.

B.T. Evetts and A.J. Butler, 1895

The Churches and Monasteries of Egypt and some Neighbouring countries, attributed to Abû Salih the Armenian, Oxford: Clarendon Press.

J. Forget, 1963

Synaxarium Alexandrinum, Corpus Scriptorum Christianorum Orientalium 47, 48, 49, Louvain: Peeters.

G. Gabra, 1996

"Untersuchungen zum Difnar der Koptischen Kirche." Bulletin de la Societé d'Archéologie Copte 35: 37-52.

____, 1998

"Untersuchungen zum Difnar der Koptischen Kirche." Bulletin de la Societé d'Archéologie Copte 37: 48-64.

G. Godron, 1983

"лімни Portrait, Image." Bulletin de la Societé d'Archéologie Copte 25: 1-52.

____, 1990

"A nouveau лімні (complements)." Bulletin de la Societé d'Archéologie Copte 29: 43-47.

G.R. Delahaye, 2003

G. Graf, 1934

Catalogue des Manuscrits Arabe Chrétiens conservé au Caire, Studi e Testi 63, Vatican.

____, 1947.

Geschichte der Christlichen Arabischen Literatur, Studi e Testi 133, Vol II Vatican.

S. Grébaut, 1926

Le Synaxaire Ethiopien- le mois de Tahschasch, Patrologia Orientalis 15 Paris : Firmin-Didot.

R. Habib, 1966

al-Kanais al-Qibtiya al-Qadimah bi al-Qahihra (the Ancient Coptic Churches in Cairo) Cairo.

S. Khalil, 1985

Al-Safi Ibn al-'Assâl, brefs chapitres sur la Trinité et l'incarnation, [Patrologia Orientalis 42, fasc 3], Turnhout: Brepols.

___, 1985a

"Traité perdu d'al-Safi ibn al-'Assal sur l'incarnation du Christ, de l'Esprit-Saint et de la Vierge Marie." In After Chalcedon. Studies in Theology and Church History offered to Professor Albert Van Roey for his Seventieth Birthday, [Orientalia Lovansiensa Aanalecta 18] Louvain: Peeters, pp. 285-296.

____, 1991

"Safi ibn al-Assal." In *Coptic Encyclopedia*, Vol 7, New York: MacMillan, pp. 2075-2079.

L. Leroy, 1909; 1910

"Histoire d'Abraham le Syrien, patriarche copte d'Alexandrie." *ROC* 14: 380-400; 15: 26-41.

Macrizi, 1979

Macrizi's Geschichte der Copten von Wüstenfeld, 1st ed. Göttingen 1845, 2nd ed. Hildsheim: Olms.

M. Martin, 1997

"Le Delta chrétien à la fin du XII°s." Orientalia Christiana Periodica 63: 181-199.

O.F.A Meinardus, 1977

Christian Egypt Ancient and Modern, 2nd edition, Cairo: American University in Cairo.

De Lacy O'Leary, 1926

The Difnar of the Coptic Church from the manuscript in the John Rylands library with fragments of a Difnar recently discovered at the Der Abu Makar in Wadi n-Natrun, Vol I-II, London: Luzac & Co.

Y. Ragib, 1999

"Le site du Muqattam." *Annales Islamologiques* 33: 159-184. Heg. Yuhanna Salama, 1979

al-La'ali' al-Nafîfah fî Sharh Tukûs wa Mu^ctaqadât al-Kanîsah (= The precious Pearls for the explanation of the Rites and Dogma of the Church); Vol II, 4th edition, Cairo.

A.Y.Sidarus, 1982

"Ibn ar-Rahib." In *Encyclopedie de l'Islam Supp.* Leiden: Brill, pp. 396-397.

M. Simaika, 1942

Catalogue of Coptic and Arabic Manuscripts ..., Vol. II part I, Cairo.

Samuel al-Suriani, Nabih Kamel Daoud, 1992

Tarîkh al-Abâ' al-Batârikah lil anba Yûsâb usquf fûwwah (= History of the Fathers the Patriarchs by Yusab bishop of Fuwwah), Cairo.

Samuel al-Suriani, 1984

Tarikh al-kana'is wal-'adyarah, Cairo, 4 Vol.

____, 1990

"Icônes et iconographie d'après le manuscrit d'Abu el-Makarim, publié en arabe au Caire 1984." *Le Monde Copte* 18: 78.

G. Troupeau, 1974

Catalogue des Manuscrits Arabes -Première Partie - Manuscrits Chrétiens, Paris: Bibliothèque Nationale. vol 2.

F. Vansleb, 1678

The present state of Egypt or A new relation of a late voyage into that Kingdom performed in the years 1672-1673, London.

L. Villecourt, 1925

"Les Observances liturgiques du Jeûne dans l'Eglise Copte." *Le Muséon* 38: 265.

Y.N. Youssef, 1993

"Un témoin méconnu de la littérature copte." Bulletin de la Société d'Archéologie Copte 32: 139-147.

____, 1995

"A propos d'un terme ambigü chez abou el Makarim." *Göttinger Mizsellen* 145: 101-103.

___, 1995a

"Une relecture des glorifications coptes." *Bulletin de la Société d'Archéologie Copte* 34: 77-83.

__, 1997

"La terminologie de l'icône selon les livres liturgiques Coptes." *Göttinger Miszellen* 158: 101-105.

___, 1997a

"Une relecture des Théotokies Coptes." Bulletin de la Société d'Archéologie Copte 36: 153-170.

____, 1998-1999

"Multiconfessional churches in Egypt during the XII Century." *Bulletin of Saint Shenouda the Archmandrite Coptic Society* 5: 45-54.

____, 2003

"Severus of Antioch in the Coptic Theotokia." In *Prayer and Spirituality in the Early Church: Liturgy and life*, Volume 3, edited by B. Neil, G. Dunn and L. Cross, Sydney, pp. 93-108.

____, 2004

"The Coptic Marian homilies of Severus of Antioch." *Bulletin de la Société d'Archéologie Copte* 43: 127-140.

U. Zanetti, 1995

"Abu L-Makarim et Abu Salih." *Bulletin de la Société d'Archéologie Copte* 34: 85-133.