# Georgian Christian Thought and Its Cultural Context

Memorial Volume for the 125th Anniversary of Shalva Nutsubidze (1888-1969)

Edited by

Tamar Nutsubidze, Cornelia B. Horn, and Basil Lourié

With the Collaboration of Alexey Ostrovsky



## BRILL

LEIDEN · BOSTON 2014

## CONTENTS

Abbreviations	vii
Preface	ix
List of Contributors	xi

## PART ONE

## SHALVA NUTSUBIDZE AND HIS WORLD

Selected Bibliography of Shalva Nutsubidze's Scholarly Works	3
Shalva Nutsubidze: From Alethology to Neoplatonism	11
Tamar Nutsubidze	
Alethology as the First Philosophy	18
Demur Jalaghonia	

## PART TWO

## THE EPOCH OF THE CORPUS AREOPAGITICUM

Geopolitics and Georgian Identity in Late Antiquity: The Dangerous	
World of Vakhtang Gorgasali	29
Christopher Haas	
Transgressing Claims to Sacred Space: The Strategic Advantage of	
the Portability of Relics for Antichalcedonians in Syria-Palestine in	
the Fifth and Sixth Centuries CE	45
Cornelia B. Horn	
The Corpus Areopagiticum and Proclus' Divine Interface	69
Tuomo Lankila	
The Philosophy of Dionysius the Areopagite: An Approach to	
Intensional Semantics	81
Basil Lourié	
The Author of the Scholia of the <i>Doctrina Patrum</i>	128
David Shengelia	
Severus of Antioch as Canonist in the Copto-Arabic Tradition	138
Youhanna Nessim Youssef	
Zur Bedeutung der Begriffe ,Hypostase' und ,Prosopon' bei Babai	
dem Großen	151
Alexander Toepel	

### CONTENTS

## PART THREE IOANE PETRITSI AND HIS TIME

'One in the Beings' and 'One within Us': The Basis of the Union with	
the One in Ioane Petritsi's Interpretation of Proclus' ${\it Elements}~of$	
Theology	175
Lela Alexidze	
Ioane Petritsi's Preface to His Annotated Translation of the Book of	
Psalms	194
Levan Gigineishvili	
Ioane Petritsi and John Italus on Two Original Causes	236
Damana Melikishvili	
Georgian Translations of Nicetas Stethatos's Epistles (According to	
Arsen Iqaltoeli's <i>Dogmatikon</i> )	244
Maia Raphava	

## PART FOUR

## SHOTA RUSTAVELI AND GEORGIAN CULTURE

Towards Rustaveli's Place in Medieval European-Christian Thought	285
Elguja Khintibidze	
Shota Rustaveli's Romance The Knight in the Panther's Skin in the	
Context of European Chivalric Romance: An Anthropological	
Approach	308
Maka Elbakidze and Irma Ratiani	
Philosophical Ideas of the Corpus Areopagiticum in The Knight in the	
Panther's Skin	317
Mikheil Makharadze	
Religious Inculturation and Problems of Social History of the	
Georgian Language	327
Nino Doborjginidze	
The Application of Thought to Language Learning: An Example	
from the Study of Old Georgian	344
Adam C. McCollum	
Index	375

## SEVERUS OF ANTIOCH AS CANONIST IN THE COPTO-ARABIC TRADITION

Youhanna Nessim Youssef<sup>1</sup>

## Introduction

In a recent study, F. Alpi discussed Severus of Antioch's role in the ecclesiastical legislation of Justinian.<sup>2</sup> While working on the edition of the Arabic *Life of Severus of Antioch* attributed to Athanasius, who was patriarch of Antioch at the beginning of the seventh century, I was intrigued by the number of attestations to the Canons of Severus in that text. This prompted me to re-examine the Arabic manuscripts of canonical law in order to discern more clearly Severus's prominence in ecclesiastical law in the Copto-Arabic tradition. This article shows the significant respect and stature which Severus the canonist enjoyed.

## Canons of Severus in His Biography Attributed to Athanasius

As it is known that Severus studied Law in Beirut, the author of the biography of Severus that is attributed to Athanasius placed emphasis on Severus's legal background. This section collects and highlights all references to canons in Severus's biography.

§ 58

وكانكل واحد منهم متعلق القلب بساويرس وكان يظنوا في يوليانس الاسقف انه ساويرس فصرخ الشعب وقالوا له تكلم ولا تسكت فهذا موضع يظهر فيه القوي ويبن فيه الجبار ضعف المقاوم للحق هذا الوقت الذي تسل فيه سيفك وتسد افواه المتكلمين على الله بالعظايم ثم اخرج حجرك الذي هو الكلمة الروحانية الذي يخرج من فيك واهلك الفلسطيني الذي هو مقدنيوس واضطهده واحزنه كن ثابتًا بنطقك

 $<sup>^{1}\,</sup>$  I would like to thank to my colleague Lisa Agai<br/>bi for reading the English text and suggesting many corrections.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> F. Alpi, "Sévère d'Antioche et la législation ecclésiastique de Justinien," in *Acts of the Symposium Syriacum in Malta* (forthcoming).

And everyone's heart was eager to see Severus, because they thought that Bishop Julian was Severus. The people cried out loud and said to him: "Speak and do not be silent, for in this situation the strong one will be revealed and the mighty one will show the weakness of the one who resists the truth. This is the time to draw your sword and shut the mouth of those that speak great things against God. Cast your stone, which is the spiritual word that goes forth from your mouth, and destroy the Philistine, who is Macedonius. Persecute him and make him sad. *Be steadfast in your speech and canons*, be strong and draw near unto battle, and resist the lawyers, for you are the father of ordinances. Conquer your adversaries, and grant us a portion with you, that we may have glory in victory!" And they were waiting to be with Macedonius privately.

§ 75

And when the king heard that Macedonius did not consent to Severus's faith, he was displeased and handed over Macedonius to Severus that he might *apply the canons of the Church* upon him. And then by the king's order Severus wrote with humility the canons of the faith, and said thus:<sup>3</sup>

§ 93

"You adorned the Church by your sayings on the straight faith, you enlightened the Church by your *holy canons* and your orthodox teachings everywhere"<sup>4</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> This part is also mentioned in the *Confession of the Fathers* and translated into Latin. See *Recta fides scripta ad Anastasium imperatorem* (M. Geerard, *Clavis Patrum Graecorum*, Vol. 3 (Turnhout: Brepols, 1979), N 7070[16]).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> The quotations follow the sections of the edition in Y. N. Youssef, *The Arabic life of Severus of Antioch attributed to Athanasius*, PO 49.4, N 220 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2004). It seems that the Coptic substratum of the second word is the word COCAEA which has a double meaning either 'adorn' (as in our text) or 'comfort' (which gave more sense in our context, cf. Youhanna Nessim Youssef, "Two notes on the Coptic Theotokias" *Scrinium* 5 (2009), 56-84).

§ 124

And what Father Severus had done was reported to the king, \* who stopped seeking him. And when a word came to the Patriarch Severus that the king had stopped seeking him, he arose and returned to Antioch. And the help of God and his might were with him, and he wrote spiritual letters and sent them to the orthodox congregations in all places in order to strengthen them in their faith, and *he provided them with canons that were full of eloquence and spiritual logic, by the support of the Holy Spirit.* 

§ 128

You are the mustard seed, which has grown mightily such that believers have found shelter beneath its branches (cf. Matt 13:31), *meaning, your canons which you provided to the Church*, are those which give us shelter.

§ 142

And when the king and his notables<sup>5</sup> heard the speech of Father Severus, they marvelled at his wisdom, and the conflicts which he endured, and the depth of his wisdom, and his interpretation. And the king considered what to do to Saint Severus, because it was obvious to him<sup>6</sup> that *he was steadfast in his faith and his canons.* 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> The Coptic has "and the senate."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Lit., "for he saw that he was".

Another quotation from the *Life of Severus of Antioch* by Athanasius is narrated in the Difnar<sup>7</sup> in the Doxology Batos for the 10th day of Kiahk.<sup>8</sup>

* Бен иггос мвері итац ием	
NEYKANDN $\overline{COY}$ CTAYTHITOY	
инієкклнсіа итє піороодозо	C

with new songs and *with His holy Canons*, that he gave to the Orthodox Church

It is known that Severus of Antioch composed songs.<sup>9</sup> The second part of the stanza of the Doxology refers to the role of Severus as a canonist.

When reconsidering the data contained in the biography of Severus as well as the praise Severus received in the Difnar one notes the emphasis placed on the word "Canons." The respective authors likely expressed themselves in this way in order to show that Severus's theological positions were justified by the "Canons" of the Church.

## Severus of Antioch in the Anonymous Collection of Berlin

There is an anonymous collection of canons in Berlin, preserved in a single undated manuscript, MS Berlin Arabic 107, folio 59 verso, which contains "Temporal Canons" (*"Zeitliche Canones*"); Canons for the priests and the clergy.<sup>10</sup> A canon of Saint Severus of Antioch is mentioned: "When a Priest or a deacon denies the Christian faith."

The canonical collection is that of Macarius, the monk of the Monastery of Saint John the Little according to MS Paris Arab 251. This manuscript is dated to 1353 CE.<sup>11</sup>

In the following, we will quote the canons that contain the name of Severus in this collection:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Antiphonarium (Arabic Difnar). This book contains a collection of hymns for the whole year. The hymn of the Antiphonarium is sung in the service of the Psalmodia which follows the office of Compline. Cf. G. Gawdat, "Untersuchungen zum Difnar der koptischen Kirche. I: Quellenlage, Forschungsgeschichte und künftige Aufgaben," BSAC 35 (1996): 37–54; idem, "Untersuchungen zum Difnar der koptischen Kirche. II zur Kompilation," BSAC 37 (1998): 49–68.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> De L. O'Leary, *The Difnar (Antiphonarium) of the Coptic Church*, Vol. 1 (London: Luzac & Co 1926), 82–83.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Cf. E. W. Brooks, *The Hymns of Severus and others in the Syriac version of Paul of Edessa as revised by James of Edessa*, PO 6.1 and 7.3 (Paris, 1911–1912).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> W. Riedel, *Die Kirchenrechtsquellen des Patriarchats Alexandrien* (Leipzig, 1900; Reprinted Aalen, 1968), 130.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> G. Troupeau, Catalogue des manuscrits arabes, Vol. 1 (Paris, 1972), 208–209.

Fol. 195, new 73 Arabic

بسم الاب والابن والروح القدس اله واحد هذه القوانين الزمنية التي وضعهتا اباو نا القديسين الذين تقدموا قبلنا من أجل صعوبة الزمان و رغبة التاييبين بقلب قريح صلاتهم و بركاتهم تكون معنا امينا القانون السادس قس او شماس يجحد الامانة الالمسيحية ويخرج عن المذهب ثم يتوب بعد هذا يغفر له ذنبه فاما خدمة القداس فلا يمكن منها عاجلا بل انكان قسيس فعل هذا فليمنع من الخدمة المقدسة اربع سنين اذا تاب بقلب قريح ودموع وانكان الذي فعل ذلك شماس فلهم ثلثة سنين خارج عن الخدمة المقدسة والقانون الرسو لي المقدس يامر ان مثل هؤلاء لا يعانوا خدمة القداس الى الابد لكن ساويرس البطرير ك القديس يقول ان الامر يضطرنا من اجل قساوة القلب وفساد الزمان ان نرخص في هذا القليل بقدر الطاقة ونرفق ببعضهم

In the name of the Father, and the Son, and the Holy Spirit, one God. These are the temporal canons that were established by our holy fathers who preceded us for times of difficulty and contriteness of those who repent with a pure heart. May their prayers and their blessings be with us. Amen. Canon 6

Concerning a priest or deacon who denies the Christian faith, and converts to another religion and then later repents: Let his sin be forgiven. As for the celebration of the Eucharist, the following applies only in the case of sincere repentance with a contrite heart: a priest should be prevented from celebrating and partaking of the Eucharist for four years and not any earlier. A deacon must be prevented from holy service for a period of three years. The holy apostolic canon commands that these should not approach the service of the Eucharist forever. However the holy patriarch Severus says that [since] the matter may force us, because of the hardness of the heart and the bad times let us give in this a little as much as we can and let us have pity on some of them.

### Commentary

The expression صعوبة الزمان "bad times" came to be very recurrent. It is used in the correspondence of John XIII,<sup>12</sup> who frequently speaks of "bad times" [ $s\bar{u}'/fas\bar{a}d$  az-zamān]."<sup>13</sup>

It seems that this patriarch refers indirectly to Canons of Severus which were written (according to the Manuscript of Paris) two centuries earlier.

## Severus in the Compendium of Farag-allah al-Akhmimi

The manuscript evidence for the *Compendium* of Farag-allah al-Akhmimi<sup>14</sup> comprises MS Paris BN Arabic 250. On fol. 240b we find an additional quire that includes a chapter on the Priests taken from Severus.<sup>15</sup> We have already demonstrated elsewhere that this text is the "Recommendation to the Priests" of Severus of Ashmunein and not by Severus of Antioch.<sup>16</sup>

Severus of Antioch in The Lamp of Darkness

Shams al-Riyasah Abu al-Barakat, called Ibn Kabar,<sup>17</sup> who lived in the second part of the thirteenth century and died on Thursday, May 10, 1324 CE,<sup>18</sup> was a great scholar of his time. His book *The Lamp of Darkness for the Explanation of the Service* is an encyclopaedia of all the ecclesiastical

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> This patriarch was a monk from the monastery of al-Muharraq. S. Y. Labib, "John XIII," in *The Coptic Encyclopedia*, Vol. 4, ed. A. S. Atiya (New York: Macmillan, 1991), 1346–1347. (I was unable to find this information elsewhere). For his biography cf. A. Khater and O. H. E. Burmester, *History of the Patriarchs of the Egyptian Church known as the History of the Holy Church*, Vol. 3, Pt. 3, Textes et documents 13 (Le Caire, 1970), fol. 257r, p. 159 (text), p. 274 (translation).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> T. El-Leithy, *Coptic culture and conversion in Medieval Cairo 1295–1524*, Ph.D. thesis (Princeton University, January 2005), 379 (unpublished).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> V. Frederick, "Farajallah al-Akhmimi," in *The Coptic Encyclopedia*, Vol. 4, ed. A. S. Atiya (New York: Macmillan, 1991), 1089. G. Graf, *Geschichte der Christlichen Arabischen Literatur*, Studi e Testi 133 (Città del Vaticano, 1947), 427–428. While editing the canons of Hippolytus, R. G. Coquin assessed the quotations of Farag-allah as second-hand information. Cf. R.-G. Coquin, *Les canons d'Hippolyte*, PO 31.2 (Paris, 1966), [11] 279, n. 23.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Troupeau, *Catalogue*, 208; G. Graf, *Geschichte der Christlichen Arabischen Literatur*, Studi e Testi 118 (Città del Vaticano, 1944), 420; and Riedel, *Die Kirchenrechtsquellen*, 121.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Y. N. Youssef, "Recommendations to the Priests. Severus of Antioch or Severus of Ashmunain," *Journal of Coptic Studies* 4 (2002): 187–195.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> A. Wadi, "Abu al-Barakat Ibn Kabar, Misbah al-Zulmah, cap. 18: il digiuno e la settimana santa," *SOC Collectanea* 34 (2001), 233–322.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Cf. R. G. Coquin, "Ibn Kabar," *Catholicisme* 6 (1996): 1349–1351; S. Kh. Samir, "Un manuscrit arabe d'Alep reconnu, le Sbath 1125," *Le Muséon* 91 (1978): 179–188; L. Villecourt,

knowledge of his time.<sup>19</sup> This book is divided into 24 chapters, with the first four chapters being devoted to theology, and chapters 5 and 6 to Canon Law. Chapter 7 consists of a bibliography of Christian authors, especially of those who wrote in Arabic. The remaining chapters (8–24) offer a detailed description of the liturgy of the Coptic Church of that time. Severus of Antioch is mentioned twice in this book:

The first reference to Severus occurs in chapter 5, in connection with comments concerning the Canonical Law of the Coptic Church:

قوانين أخرى غير منسوبة لأحد معين ترجمها: هذه القوانين الزمنية التي وضعها آبا ؤنا القديسون الذين تقد مواقبلنا وقرر وهامن أجل صعوبة الزمان ورغبة التائبين بقلب فريج (حاشية) في بعض فصولهم استشهاد بكلام أنبا ساويرس البطريرك وجملها بل كلها فيا يتعلق بالكهنة—الاسقف فمادونه بدايتها: اذار فع على اسقف بسبب زنا أو بسبب شئ من ذل وغايتها: في كاهن يصلي عليه للزيجة وتوفت امرأته قبل اجتماعه بها (... وما يتلوه من تمة الفصل الأخير) وعدد أوامر ها وزواجر هاستة وعشرين

Other canons, which are not attributed to anyone in particular:

Its introduction: These are the earthly canons of our holy fathers who preceded us; and they established them *for use in difficult times* and when penitents wish to return with a joyful heart.

(Remark) in some of their chapters, *there are quotations from the words of Anba Severus the Patriarch.* They are generally or entirely concerned with the priest or bishop and those who are of lesser (rank) than the priest.

(Their incipit:) Concerning an adulterous matter or any other humiliating act submitted to a bishop.

144

<sup>&</sup>quot;Les observances liturgiques et la discipline du jeûne dans l'Eglise Copte," *Le Muséon* 36 (1922): 267–268.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> S. Kh. Samir, "L'encyclopedie Liturgique d'Ibn Kabar (+ 1324) et son apologie d'usage Coptes," in *Crossroads of Cultures. Studies in Liturgy and Patristics in Honor of Gabriele Winkler*, ed. H.-J. Feulner, E. Velkouska, and R. Taft, OCA 260 (Rome: PIO, 2000), 629–655.

(Its end:) Concerning a newly married priest whose wife died before their marriage was consummated (and what follows up to the end of the last chapter). The number of the commands and interdictions is twenty-six.<sup>20</sup>

In 1900, W. Riedel offered what thus far is the only study of the corpus of Canonical law<sup>21</sup> mentioned in Abu al-Barakat ibn Kabar. In his work, Riedel provided a complete list of the canonical texts mentioned in Ibn Kabar and known at his time.<sup>22</sup>

It seems that the manuscript of Canon 5 in the Library of the Patriarchate in Cairo is the same as the one to which Ibn Kabar referred. It contains a canonical collection. During my visit to Cairo in 2004, however, I learned that this manuscript is now lost.<sup>23</sup> Here is the description of Simaika:

Collections of various canons: ...3) *Of the saintly fathers on the difficulties of the times.*" 131 folios, 20 lines, 26x18 cm. Titles in red. Copied by Nakhlah Quzman. In parts it is wrongly vocalised. Not dated.<sup>24</sup>

The second reference to Severus is in chapter seven concerning the bibliography of Christian authors:<sup>25</sup>

> ساويرس بطريرك أنطاكية: ١- له فصول في إثبات الإمانة الارثوذكسية تردضمن سيرته . ب- واقوال في تفسير بعضكلام الأناجيل المقدسة

Severus, Patriarch of Antioch:

A- He wrote several chapters defending the Orthodox faith, which are included in his biography.

B- Sayings explaining some verses of the holy Gospels.<sup>26</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Unfortunately there is no critical edition of this important book. This quotation is taken from the popular edition with the introduction by S. Kh. Samir, *Misbah al-Zulmah fi Idah al-Hidmah*, مصباح الظلمة في ايضاح الخدمة *[The Lamp of Darkness for the explanation of the Service]* (Cairo: Al-Karûz bookshop, 1971), 201.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> For an overview, cf. R. G. Coquin, "Canon Law," in *Coptic Encyclopedia*, Vol. 2, ed. S. Atyia (New York: MacMillan, 1991), 449–451.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Riedel, *Die Kirchenrechtsquellen*, 15–80.

 $<sup>^{23}\,</sup>$  Jan.–Feb. 2004. Information about the manuscript was provided by M. Nabih Kamel Daoud.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> M. Simaika and Y. 'Abd al-Masih, *Catalogue of the Coptic and Arabic Manuscripts in the Coptic Museum, the Patriarchate, the Principal Churches of Cairo and Alexandria and the Monasteries of Egypt* (Cairo, 1942), 257.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Cf. Graf, *Geschichte* (1944), 418.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Samir, *Misbah al-Zulmah*, 293.

## Commentary

The text of Severus's biography that is referenced here survived partially in Coptic.<sup>27</sup> The complete text is found in Arabic and in Geez.<sup>28</sup> Ibn Kabar alluded to the biography of Severus of Antioch ascribed to Athanasius of Antioch, which contained two theological chapters against Macedonius the Patriarch of Constantinople, and an apology given before Emperor Justinian.<sup>29</sup>

The *Book of the Confessions of the Fathers*, composed by an anonymous author in the eleventh century, also mentions two extracts from the *Life of Severus*, one concerning Macedonius, and one pertaining to an apology before Emperor Justinian; hence this quotation strongly indicates that the *Life of Severus* was translated into Arabic three centuries before Ibn Kabar.

In its biography of Michael IV (1092–1102 CE), the 68<sup>th</sup> patriarch, the *History of the Patriarchs* mentions two quotations from the corpus of writings associated with Severus as author or subject matter.<sup>30</sup> Deacon John ibn Sa'îd al-Kulzumî, who was an eyewitness of these events, wrote the biography of Michael IV and mentioned therein that the bishops chose a Syrian monk to become patriarch, but found him to be of heterodox faith. So one of the bishops, Anba Sanhût, bishop of Cairo (Misr), started to provide patristic quotations in support of his point of view. He mentioned the letter, which Severus wrote to Emperor Anastasius after the excommunication of Macedonius, the Patriarch of Constantinople. This quotation is taken from the biography of Severus attributed to Athanasius.<sup>31</sup>

Other works of Severus in the book of Ibn Kabar consist of some explanations on the Gospels. In this material, Ibn Kabar alluded to the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> E. Goodspee and W. E. Crum, *The Conflict of Severus Patriarch of Antioch by Athanasius*, PO 4.6 (Paris, 1908), 578 [10]—585 [17]; W. Till, *Koptische Heiligen- und Martyrerlegenden*, OCA 102 and 108 (Rome, 1935–1936), 1935, p. 188–200; 1936, p. 141–143; H. Munier, *Manuscrits coptes (Catalogue général des antiquités égyptiennes du Musée du Caire*) (Le Caire, 1916), 52–53; and T. Orlandi, "Un Codice Copto del 'Monastero Bianco' Economii de Severo di Antiochia, Marco Evangelista, Atanasio Di Alessandria," *Le Muséon* 81 (1968): 351–405.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> The edition of the Arabic text by Youhanna Nessim Youssef is forthcoming. For the Ge'ez text, see Goodspeed and Crum, *The Conflict of Severus*.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Goodspee and Crum, *The Conflict of Severus*, 650–670 and 704–709.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> For the sources of the *History of the Patriarchs*, see J. Den Heijer, *Mawhub ibn Mansur ibn Mufarrig et l'historiographie copto-arabe*, CSCO 513, Subsidia 83 (Louvain: Peeters, 1989), 142–145.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> A. S. Atiya, Y. Abd Al-Masih, and O. H. E. Burmester, *History of the Patriarchs of the Egyptian Church*, Vol. II, Pt. III (Cairo: Société d'Archéologie Copte, 1959), 238 (text), 379 (translation).

catena on the Gospels, which survived in Coptic.<sup>32</sup> The catena on the Gospels was also translated into Arabic.<sup>33</sup> In this catena, the name of Severus of Antioch occurs several times. For our discussion of the material from the *History of the Patriarchs* it is relevant to note that in the above-mentioned chapter offering Michael IV's biography, Bishop Anba Sanhût also provided a part of the catena on the Gospel of Saint John.<sup>34</sup>

## A Coptic Quotation from Severus's Canons

A hymn book from the Monastery of Epiphanius that contains several hymns in Greek includes in its text three quotations, one each from the apostle Paul, Athanasius, and Severus of Antioch. It seems that the quotation pertinent to Severus was part of the canons of Severus of Antioch concerning the priests and clergy presented above:

педач нбі апа сечнрос піархієпіскопос нтантіохіа де ерфан пршне епібунеі бухеіротоніа бупростасіа <del>ни</del> оутруфн булітоургіа ан маречеіме нач бутехнн неанифі н неамкіле п оутехнн нлогікн

Apa Severus, the Archbishop of Antioch said: "If a man desiring ordination desires dignity and luxury and not priestly service, let him (rather) acquire a carpenter's or a smith's craft or a learned profession.<sup>35</sup>

## General Conclusions

It is known that Severus of Alexandria studied philosophy in Alexandria and law in Beirut.<sup>36</sup> Most of his known works deal primarily with theology (i.e. philosophy),<sup>37</sup> but nothing is known about his canonical activity.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> P. de Lagarde, *Catenae in Evangelia Aegyptiacae* (Göttingen, 1886; reprinted Osnabrück, 1971), cf. p. vi (Introduction) and the index of proper names under "Severus."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> F. Caubet Iturbe, *La cadena arabe del Evangelio de San Mateo II*, Studi e Testi 255 (Città del Vaticano, 1970).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> de Lagarde, *Catenae*, 225:3–8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> W. E. Crum and H. G. Evelyn White, *The Monastery of Epiphanius at Thebes*, The Metropolitan Museum of Art, Egyptian Expedition, Part II: Coptic and Greek Ostraca and papyri (New York, 1926), 10 (text), 161 (translation) text number 49/14.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Cf. M. A. Kugener, *Vie de Sévère attribué à Jean de Beith Aphtonia*, PO 2.3, N° 8 (Paris: Firmin-Didot 1904), 113–124; M.-A. Kugener, *Sévère Patriarche d'Antioche 512–518 par Zacharie le Scholastique*, PO 2.1, N° 6 (Turnhout: Brepols, 1993), 12.46–47. K. E. McVey, *Georg, Bishop of the Arabs, A Homily on blessed Mar Severus Patriarch of Antioch*, CSCO 531, Script. Syr. 217 (Louvain, 1993) 4–5.113–124.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Cf. Geerard, *Clavis Patrum Graecorum*, 329–345, N 7033–7080.

Several times, Severus of Antioch evoked the role of the bishops, priests, deacons, and laypeople in his writings.<sup>38</sup> One particular work in the tradition, that deals with the subject matter, however, as we argued above, should not be identified with the work *Recommendation to the priests*, which is ascribed to Severus of Antioch,<sup>39</sup> but in fact it was the work of Severus of Ashmunein.<sup>40</sup>

Ibn Kabar had accurately mentioned two works of Severus of Antioch which were accessible to him at his time in Arabic:

- 1. The *Life of Severus* attributed to Athanasius, which was translated in the eleventh century (as attested in the *Confessions of the Fathers* and the *History of the Patriarchs*).
- 2. The Coptic /Arabic catena, which was translated also in the eleventh or twelfth century (as attested in the *History of the Patriarchs*).

From all the texts discussed here, only the fragments from the monastery of Epiphanius could really reflect the canonical activities of Severus of Antioch. The other texts assembled in this dossier kept the souvenirs of such activities without providing any evidence of quotations of his canons. Modern scholars were also misled by the medieval texts. We hope that one day a scholar will find the canonical texts of Severus of Antioch.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> See R. Darling, *The patriarchate of Severus of Antioch*, *512–518*, PhD thesis (University of Chicago, 1982), 92–125 (unpublished).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Geerard, Clavis Patrum Graecorum, 333, N 7057.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Youssef, "Recommendations to the Priests," 187–196.

M

Pl. 1. Ms. Paris Arabe 251 (AD 1353), a collection of canonical works compiled by Macarius the canonist. fol. 212.



Pl. 2. Ms. Paris Arabe 250 (AD 1357), a collection of canonical works by Faragallah al-Akhmimi and recommendations to the priests, fol. 240.